

West Valley Citizen Task Force

January 5, 2000

Jack D. Parrott
Project Scientist
Office of Nuclear Material Safety and Safeguards
Mail Stop T-8F37
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Washington, D.C. 20555

Dear Mr. Parrott:

This statement is submitted on behalf of the West Valley Citizen Task Force (CTF) in response to the issuance of a draft policy statement in the Federal Register Notice of December 3, 1999 (64 FR 67952) with regard to the proposed application of the U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission's (NRC) License Termination Rule (LTR, 10CFR Part 20, Subpart E) as the decommissioning criteria for the West Valley Demonstration Project.

The CTF was formed by the U.S. Department of Energy (DOE) and the New York State Energy Research and Development Authority (NYSERDA) and held its first meeting January 29, 1997, almost three years ago. The CTF unanimously adopted a Final Report on July 29, 1998 which established Policies, Priorities and Guidelines for the decontamination and decommissioning of the West Valley Site. The CTF will support those governmental actions which advance the goals of the Final Report.

The CTF wants to thank the Commissioners and staff of the NRC for the hard work and detailed consideration which they have given to this matter. With the many issues of national significance which the NRC must confront, we are very grateful that so much time and attention has been spent on West Valley. The NRC's willingness to alter its position during the debate that has gone on over the past year is an example of the strength of our system of government. We all very much appreciate what has occurred.

The CTF has been an active participant in the considerations which the NRC has undertaken since the NRC staff proposed SECY-98-251. The CTF submitted written comments dated December 22, 1998 on SECY-98-251, verbal testimony before the NRC Commissioners on January 12, 1999 in Washington, D.C., and written comments dated March 29, 1999 in response to SECY 99-057. The CTF, as stated in its March 29, 1999 written comments, generally supports SECY 99-057 and supports the application of the LTR to West Valley. This important policy, when implemented, will guarantee that West Valley has the same cleanup goals as all other sites in the United States.

5. **Consider Longer Time Period** - The LTR uses a 1,000-year time frame for estimating future doses. This time period is based on the relatively low levels of radioactivity and on the low potential for changes in the physical characteristics of typical decommissioned sites (62 FR 39083). Certain sites such as West Valley may have higher levels of long-lived radionuclides and higher potential for changes in site characteristics than most sites. We ask that the Commission consider a longer time frame for such sites in applying the LTR.
6. **Five-Year Review Period, Long-Term Enforceability, and Financial Assurance for Institutional Controls** - The CTF sees some potential problems in applying institutional controls to complex sites such as West Valley. The CTF believes that periodic rechecks "no less frequently than every five years to assure that the institutional controls remain in place..." as required by the LTR under Section 20.1403(e), may be too infrequent, especially in view of the levels of exposure (up to 500 mrem/yr) if institutional controls are lost. In addition, the CTF is concerned about undue reliance on a governmental "statement of intent" or "arrangement that is deemed acceptable by such government entity" in providing financial assurance for long-term institutional controls. The CTF believes that such government statements and arrangements are not enforceable. By law, governments cannot make open-ended commitments that are binding on future government administrations. Likewise, governments cannot encumber money or guarantee future appropriations. For these reasons, the CTF is concerned that federal and state commitments made today in good faith are unenforceable. It is possible for them to be legally rescinded or scaled back in the future, resulting in either a reduced level of protection or a shifting of costs to local governments. These uncertainties are most acute at large, complex sites such as West Valley. Complex questions of institutional controls may arise at such sites, and large sums may be needed in perpetuity for routine purposes and/or emergency expenditures. For sites of this type, the CTF recommends consideration of dedicated trust funds and/or other highly reliable methods of financial assurance.
7. **CTF Positions** - In the Statement of Policy under the section titled Background, the position of the CTF regarding the suitability of West Valley for long-term isolation of waste is stated in brief. The CTF believes that its positions are not susceptible to paraphrasing and must be considered as a whole as stated in its Final Report dated July 29, 1998.
8. **Incidental Waste** - The CTF had opposed prior proposals regarding the application of an incidental waste policy to West Valley. We are pleased that this apparently has been deleted from the West Valley proceedings. We are still concerned that the proposed incidental waste proposal may find its way to West Valley through another pathway. We urge that the incidental waste proposal not be applied to West Valley now or in the future. Should a proceeding be commenced that would affect West Valley, we request notice and an opportunity to participate.
9. **Use of ALARA** - The CTF wants to emphasize the importance of using the As Low As Reasonably Achievable (ALARA) principles to the WVDP cleanup standards and not to automatically apply the thresholds of 25, 100, and 500 mrem. The requirement of achieving the best cleanup that is possible, given all the circumstances, is of great importance.

In conclusion, the CTF wishes to commend the NRC Commission and staff for their efforts on behalf of the West Valley site. We strongly urge that the LTR be applied to the site and that the Policy Statement, with the modifications which we have suggested, be adopted.

Respectfully submitted,



West Valley CTF

APPENDIX 1*(taken from CTF's 7/29/98 Report to NYSERDA and U.S. DOE)***CTF Membership**

Mr. Pete Cooney
International Assoc. of Machinists and Aerospace
Workers
10987 Galen Hill Road
Freedom, NY 14065
Work: (716) 492-2387 or 2313
Home: (716) 492-2387

Mr. Bill King
Town of Ashford
P.O. Box 306
West Valley, NY 14171
Work: (716) 942-6016
Home: (716) 942-3223

Ms. Nevella McNeil
8243 Route 240
Machias, NY 14101
Work: (716) 942-4086
Home: (716) 942-3258

Mr. Joe Patti
677 Yacht Club Drive
Machias, NY 14101
Work: (716) 942-3262
Home: (716) 353-4162

Mr. John Pfeffer
9203 Route 240
West Valley, NY 14171
Work: (716) 645-6575
Home: (716) 942-3437

Mr. Blake Reeves
4 Cloister Court
Amherst, NY 14226
Home: (716) 833-6697

Mr. Murray Regan
P.O. Box 368
Springville, NY 14141
Work: (716) 592-4946
Fax: (716) 592-5030

Ms. Lana Redeye
Box 231
Salamanca, NY 14779
Work: (716) 945-1790, Ext. 132

Mr. Pete Scherer
P.O. Box 201
West Valley, NY 14171
Work: (716) 942-3256
Home: (716) 942-6658

Mr. Warren Schmidt
Office of Assemblyman Thomas M. Reynolds
1244 Eagle Street
Arcade, NY 14009
Work: (716) 968-1760, Ext. 47
Home: (716) 492-3812

Dr. Tim Siepel
27 Franklin Street
Springville, NY 14171
Work: (716) 592-7400
Home: (716) 942-3219

Rev. Larry Smith
P.O. Box 316
West Valley, NY 14171
Work: (716) 942-3251 or 6537
Home: (716) 942-3251

Mr. Richard Tobe
Erie County Dept. of Environment and Planning
95 Franklin Street
Buffalo, NY 14202
Work: (716) 858-6716
Home: (716) 886-5758

Mr. Ray Vaughan
135 East Main Street
Hamburg, NY 14075
Work: (716) 853-7500, Ext. 7623
Home: (716) 648-5861

Ms. Bridget Wilson
5092 Gooseneck Road
Delevan, NY 14042
Work: (716) 592-2927
Home: (716) 942-3736

Mr. Eric Wohlers
Cattaraugus County Health Department
1701 Lincoln Avenue
Olean, NY 14760
Work: (716) 373-8050